



---

Review: [untitled]

Author(s): Richard A. Shweder

Reviewed work(s):

Learning to Be Rotuman: Enculturation in the South Pacific. by Alan Howard

Source: *The American Journal of Sociology*, Vol. 78, No. 2 (Sep., 1972), pp. 482-483

Published by: The University of Chicago Press

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/2776529>

Accessed: 01/03/2010 14:13

---

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of JSTOR's Terms and Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>. JSTOR's Terms and Conditions of Use provides, in part, that unless you have obtained prior permission, you may not download an entire issue of a journal or multiple copies of articles, and you may use content in the JSTOR archive only for your personal, non-commercial use.

Please contact the publisher regarding any further use of this work. Publisher contact information may be obtained at <http://www.jstor.org/action/showPublisher?publisherCode=ucpress>.

Each copy of any part of a JSTOR transmission must contain the same copyright notice that appears on the screen or printed page of such transmission.

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact [support@jstor.org](mailto:support@jstor.org).



The University of Chicago Press is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The American Journal of Sociology*.

editors could have rounded up a few anthropologists who might have written illuminatingly on research on education in the less-developed areas. Only two major items in the book really touch directly on this issue: Helen Icken Safa's useful piece on "Education, Modernization and the Process of National Integration" and Harry Lindquist's general bibliography at the end of the volume. The bibliography is especially illuminating; whether it is adequate or not (and I am not sure that it is), the perceptive reader will note that only a tiny proportion of the works cited are by authors who could even remotely claim to be anthropologists—a fair commentary, I think, on who is doing the substantive and significant work!

*Learning to Be Rotuman: Enculturation in the South Pacific.* By Alan Howard. New York: Teachers College Press, 1970. Pp. xii+184. \$7.25 (cloth); \$4.95 (paper).

Richard A. Shweder

*Harvard University*

*Learning to Be Rotuman* is one volume in the *Anthropology and Education* series edited by Solon T. Kimball, which has accepted the responsibility for presenting the anthropological point of view to educators and their students. An educator whose initial look at socialization and education from the anthropological perspective is this book will have reason to hesitate before coming back for a second look.

The book is a case study of socialization, formal education, and character formation on the Melanesian island of Rotuma. Based on Howard's fieldwork, it has three themes:

1. Rotuman "modal personality" is seen from the point of view of interpersonal relations, and explained in terms of values and socialization practices. The author argues that the Rotumans' dominant concern is with the maintenance of harmonious interpersonal relations, and that they eschew an interest in behavioral consistency, motives, or a stable self-image.

2. A contrast is made between the kinds of knowledge transmitted and the manner of transmission of knowledge in the formal school system of the island and the system of education in the traditional culture.

3. The author describes the ability of the Rotuman to become "bi-cultural," that is, capable of functioning in two cultures (the modern world of Fiji and his traditional home) by doing what is appropriate in each. Implications are drawn for subcultural groups in the American educational system.

The book has a number of weaknesses. First, the descriptions of Rotuman culture, personality, socialization, and formal education are based on aggregate impressions by the author. The data were not systematically collected (pp. x, 117). Second, there are major conceptual ambiguities

and confusions. Howard discusses the situational sensitivity which Rotumans exhibit in their social behavior. Yet he never distinguishes variations in culturally proscribed and prescribed behavior from variations of behavior in situations where there are no cultural maps for appropriate behavior. For example, differences in the degree of respect shown to certain categories of relatives is treated in the same framework as differences in childrens' reactions to frustrations when the frustrating agent is either an adult or a peer. Only the second type of variation is relevant to personality theory (pp. 37, 51, 52, 102).

The analysis of beliefs and values is confused with the analysis of actual behavior. For example, Howard is willing to make the highly debatable assumption that Americans are not as sensitive as Rotumans to their circumstances in the actual behavior they exhibit *because* Americans show a cognitive concern for consistency in their feelings, motives, and self-images, while Rotumans do not.

His theoretical view of "modal personality" is inadequate. He defines it as the similarities in the way individuals with similar learning histories respond to the same stimuli (p. 117). This is a necessary but insufficient definition of "modal personality." Howard must also show that there are differences in the way individuals with different types of social learning histories respond to the same stimuli. Thus, he does not explicitly distinguish differences in the properties of the social and physical environment of Rotuma and America from differences in the internalized response dispositions of members of these cultures as they result from child-training practices.

Third, there is a slightly disturbing flavor of "bongo-bongoism" and intellectual arrogance in the book. Howard tells us that he did not systematically collect data (p. x) and that his treatment of Rotuman "character" may reflect more his attachment to the culture than a commitment to scientific objectivity (p. 117). The bibliography of the book is brief and includes little of the theoretical and empirical literature on social behavior or on the education of "culturally disadvantaged" children.

Yet Howard is willing to use casual evidence from an exotic culture to challenge the notion that it is a universal psychological process for individuals to develop somewhat enduring and generalized self-images and identities. He may have a good point, but no one will be convinced with evidence of this sort. The same can be said for Howard's treatment of the concept "culturally disadvantaged," which he criticizes.

The book has some virtues. Howard is insightful in his discussion of difficulties faced by Rotuman children in the formal school system which can be directly related to a discrepancy between acceptable norms of conduct in the traditional culture and the school (pp. 56, 59, 134, 167). He dispels certain ethnocentric explanations of Rotuman interpersonal behavior and makes them understandable from the native point of view. Finally, he notes the extent to which reactions to frustration (e.g., withdrawal or aggression) vary in relation to the frustrating agent (e.g., adult or peer) (pp. 51, 52, 70).