

Illness and subjectivity

(CHDV 43302; ANTH 51305)

Spring 2013

Eugene Raikhel

Comparative Human Development

eraikhel@uchicago.edu

LOCATION AND TIME

Wednesdays, 1:30 – 4:20 PM; Wiebolt Hall 230

OFFICE HOURS

Time may vary from week to week. For current office hours and to sign up, please visit: <https://wiki.uchicago.edu/display/~eraikhel/Office+hours>

Office hours are held in 5736 S. Woodlawn, #203

SUMMARY

While anthropology and other social sciences have long explored the social and cultural shaping of the self and personhood, many scholars have recently employed the rubric of “subjectivity” to articulate the links between collective phenomena and the subjective lives of individuals. This graduate seminar will examine “subjectivity”—and related concepts—focusing on topics where such ideas have been particularly fruitful: illness, pathology and suffering. Throughout the course we will critically examine the terms “self,” “personhood” and “subjectivity”—and their relationship to one another. Each week we will discuss a mix of conceptual and ethnographic readings which draw on some common analytical frameworks and categories, including narrative theory, phenomenology, psychoanalysis, biopower and science and technology studies.

PREREQUISITES AND FORMAT

This course is intended for graduate students. Special provision may be made for selected advanced undergraduates to take part as well. The course will be run in a

seminar format, with a minimum of lecturing on the part of the instructor. We will spend the majority of the time closely examining the texts for each week and discussing the problems they address. Please come to each class with two or three questions regarding the reading (whether or not you are giving a presentation that week).

Please note that the final meeting of this course occurs during reading week.

ASSIGNMENTS AND EVALUATION

Students will be evaluated on the basis of the following requirements and assignments:

- 1) **Participation** in weekly discussions.
- 2) A series of short (500 word) **reading responses**. Beginning week 2 of the course, students will write a response to the readings for each week and post it to the “Discussion Board” section of the Chalk website. The reading response can either take the form of comments or questions that arise from the readings for that week, or a comment on a reading response posted by another student. If you choose to comment on another student’s response you should make clear reference to and engage with the text(s) being discussed as well. Students who would prefer not to share their responses with their classmates, can email them directly to me. It is important that responses be posted (or emailed) by 9 AM each Wednesday.
- 3) A final 3,000 to 4,000 word **paper**, for which you may either a) make a conceptual argument drawing on readings from more than one weeks, or b) use concepts from course readings to interpret findings from your own empirical research. Due by June 12 (or June 5 for students graduating in Spring 2013).

One book will be available for purchase at the Seminary Co-op Bookstore. It is also available as an e-book through the Library’s website:

Required:

Rose, Nikolas, and Joelle M. Abi-Rached, *Neuro: The New Brain Sciences and the Management of the Mind* (Princeton University Press, 2013)

All other texts will be available in the “Course Documents” folder on Chalk.

Schedule of course sessions and readings:

April 3 – Person, self, subjectivity

- Marcel Mauss, "A category of the human mind: the notion of person; the notion of self" in *The Category of the person*, Michael Carrithers, et al. Eds. pp. 1-25.
- Dan Zahavi. 2003. "Phenomenology of self." In *The self in neuroscience and psychiatry*, T. Kircher and A. David eds. Cambridge University Press.
- Amelie Rorty. "The Vanishing Subject: The Many Faces of Subjectivity" in eds. *Subjectivity*, ed Joao Biehl, Byron Good, Arthur Kleinman, University of Chicago Press, 2007).
- Sherry Ortner. (2005) 'Subjectivity and Cultural Critique', *Anthropological Theory* 5: 31–52.
- T. M. Luhrmann, 'Subjectivity', *Anthropological Theory*, 6 (2006), 345 -361
- Byron Good, 'Theorizing the "subject" of Medical and Psychiatric Anthropology', *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute*, 18 (2012), 515–535.

April 10 – Experience and narrative

- Paul Ricoeur, "The Narrative Function." In Paul Ricoeur, *Hermeneutics & the Human Sciences* (ch 11).
- Byron Good, "The narrative representation of illness," in *Medicine, Rationality and Experience* (ch 6).
- Mattingly, Cheryl (1994) 'The Concept of Therapeutic Emplotment', *Social Science and Medicine* 38: 811–22.
- Robert Desjarlais. 1994. Struggling Along: The Possibilities for Experience among the Homeless Mentally Ill. *American Anthropologist* 96: 886-901.
- Galen Strawson, "Against narrativity," *Ratio* 17, no. 4 (2004): 428-452.
- Shaun Gallagher, "Self-narrative in schizophrenia." In *The Self in Neuroscience and Psychiatry*. Kircher and David eds. Cambridge UP, 2003. pp.336-357

April 17 – Metaphor and embodiment

- Merleau-Ponty, Maurice. 2003. "The Spatiality of One's Own Body and Motility." In *Self and Subjectivity*, Kim Atkins ed. Blackwell.
- George Lakoff. 1993 "The Contemporary Theory of Metaphor." In Andrew Ortony (ed.), *Metaphor and Thought* (second edition), Cambridge University Press.
- Laurence Kirmayer, 1992, The Body's Insistence on Meaning: Metaphor as Presentation and Representation in Illness Experience, *Medical Anthropology Quarterly*, 6(4), pp. 323-46.
- Thomas Csordas, 1993 Somatic Modes of Attention. *Cultural Anthropology* 8 (2): 135-156.
- Hinton, D., and S. Hinton, 'Panic Disorder, Somatization, and the New Cross-cultural Psychiatry: The Seven Bodies of a Medical Anthropology of Panic', *Culture, Medicine and Psychiatry*, 26 (2002), 155-178.
- Mol, Annemarie, and John Law, 'Embodied Action, Enacted Bodies: The Example of Hypoglycaemia', *Body & Society*, 10 (2004), 43-62.

April 24 – Suffering

- Kleinman, Arthur, "'Everything That Really Matters': Social Suffering, Subjectivity, and the Remaking of Human Experience in a Disordering World', *The Harvard Theological Review*, 90 (1997), 315-335
- Veena Das. 2000. "The act of witnessing: Violence, poisonous knowledge and subjectivity." In *Violence and subjectivity*. Pp. 205-225. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Joao Biehl. 2004. "Life of the mind: The interface of psychopharmaceuticals, domestic economies, and social abandonment," *American Ethnologist*, 31, pp. 475-96.
- Didier Fassin and Richard Rechtman. *The Empire of Trauma: An Inquiry into the Condition of Victimhood*. Princeton University Press: 2009. Introduction pp.1-12 (read carefully); Part One pp. 25-98 (skim/read around in); Part Four and Conclusion pp. 225-284 (read carefully).
- Shweder, Richard A., 'Suffering in Style', *Culture, Medicine and Psychiatry*, 12 (1988), 479-497.
- Joel Robbins. "Beyond the Suffering Subject: Toward an Anthropology of the Good." Forthcoming in *JRAI*.

May 1 – The self, its disturbances and the work of culture

Irving Hallowell. 1955. The Self and Its Behavioral Environment. In Hallowell, *Culture and Experience*. NY: Schocken Books. pp. 75-110

Gananath Obeyesekere. 1985. "Depression, Buddhism, and the work of culture in Sri Lanka." In A. M. Kleinman & B. Good (Eds.), *Culture and Depression*, (pp. 134-152). Berkeley: University of California Press.

Ellen Corin. 2007. "The "Other" of Culture in Psychosis," In Biehl, Good & Kleinman (eds), *Subjectivity: Ethnographic Investigations*, University of California Press, pp. 273-314.

Louis Sass – "Negative symptoms, common sense, and cultural disembedding in the modern age" in *Schizophrenia, Culture, and Subjectivity: The Edge of Experience*. Cambridge University Press, 2003.

Hollan, Douglas, 'Self Systems, Cultural Idioms of Distress, and the Psycho-Bodily Consequences of Childhood Suffering', *Transcultural Psychiatry*, 41 (2004), 62–79.

Stefania Pandolfo, 2008. "The Knot of the Soul: Postcolonial Conundrums, Madness, and the Imagination." *Postcolonial Disorders* University of California Press: 329-358.

May 8 – Emotion

Rosaldo, Michelle (1984) "Toward an Anthropology of Self and Feeling." In Richard Shweder and Robert LeVine (eds.), *Culture Theory: Essays on Mind, Self, and Emotion*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press. Pp. 137-157.

Levy, Robert I., 'Emotion, Knowing, and Culture', *Culture theory: Essays on mind, self, and emotion*, 1984, 217–234

Lutz, Catherine. "Depression and the Translation of Emotional Words." Arthur Kleinman and Byron Good (eds.). *Culture and Depression*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1985, pp.63-100.

Menon, Usha, and Richard A. Shweder, 'Kali's Tongue: Cultural Psychology and the Power of Shame in Orissa, India.', in Kitayama, Shinobu (Ed); Markus, Hazel Rose (Ed), (1994). *Emotion and culture: Empirical studies of mutual influence.* , (pp. 89-130). Washington, DC, US: American Psychological Association

Theresa D. O'Neill. 1992. "Feeling Worthless": An Ethnographic Investigation of Depression and Problem Drinking at the Flathead Reservation. *Culture, Medicine and Psychiatry* 16:447-470.

Emily Martin, 2007. Chapters 8 and 9. in *Bipolar Expeditions: Mania and Depression in American Culture*. Princeton University Press.

May 15 – Affect

Brian Massumi. "The autonomy of affect." In *Parables for the Virtual: Movement, Affect, Sensation* (Duke University Press Books, 2002)

Connolly, William E., 'Experience & Experiment', *Daedalus*, 135 (2006), 67–75

Berlant, Lauren, 'Slow Death (Sovereignty, Obesity, Lateral Agency)', *Critical Inquiry*, 33 (2007), 754–780

William Mazzarella. 2009. 'Affect: What is it Good For?' In S. Dube, ed., *Enchantments of Modernity: Empire, Nation, Globalization*. Routledge.

Papoulias, Constantina, and Felicity Callard, 'Biology's Gift: Interrogating the Turn to Affect', *Body e³ Society*, 16 (2010), 29–56

Ruth Leys, 'The Turn to Affect: A Critique', *Critical Inquiry*, 37 (2011), 434–472

[Optional: read around in the critical discussion responding to Leys' article]:

- William E. Connolly, 'The Complexity of Intention', *Critical Inquiry*, 37 (2011), 791–798
- Ruth Leys, 'Affect and Intention: A Reply to William E. Connolly', *Critical Inquiry*, 37 (2011), 799–805
- Frank, Adam, and Elizabeth A. Wilson, 'Like-Minded', *Critical Inquiry*, 38 (2012), 870–877
- Altieri, Charles, 'Affect, Intentionality, and Cognition: A Response to Ruth Leys', *Critical Inquiry*, 38 (2012), 878–881
- Leys, Ruth, 'Facts and Moods: Reply to My Critics', *Critical Inquiry*, 38 (2012), 882–891

May 22 – The self as subject

Michel Foucault. 1982. "The Subject and Power", *Critical Inquiry*, Vol. 8, No. 4, pp. 777-795.

Michel Foucault. (1997) "Technologies of the Self." Pp. 221-251 in Paul Rabinow (ed.), *Michel Foucault: Ethics, Subjectivity, and Truth*. New York: The New York Press.

Judith Farquhar and Qicheng Zhang, "Biopolitical Beijing: Pleasure, Sovereignty, and Self-Cultivation in China's Capital," *Cultural Anthropology* 20, no. 3 (August 1, 2005): 303-327.

Vinh-kim Nguyen. 2005 Antiretroviral Globalism, Biopolitics, and Therapeutic Citizenship. In *Global Assemblages: Technology, Politics, and Ethics as Anthropological Problems*. A. Ong and S. J. Collier, eds. Pp. 124–144. Malden, MA: Blackwell

Petryna, Adriana. 2004. "Biological citizenship: The Science and Politics of Chernobyl-Exposed Populations" *Osiris*, Vol. 19, pp. 250-26.

Stevenson, Lisa, 'The Psychic Life of Biopolitics: Survival, Cooperation, and Inuit Community', *American Ethnologist*, 39 (2012), 592–613

May 29 – Neuro I: the somatic self

Rose, Nikolas, and Joelle M. Abi-Rached, *Neuro: The New Brain Sciences and the Management of the Mind* (Princeton University Press, 2013)

Lock, Margaret, 'Unbound Subjectivities and New Biomedical Technologies', in *A Companion to Psychological Anthropology*, ed. by Conerly Casey and Robert B. Edgerton (Blackwell Publishing Ltd, 2007), pp. 298–314

June 5 – Neuro 2: engagements, experiments and entanglements

Latour, Bruno, 'Why Has Critique Run Out of Steam? From Matters of Fact to Matters of Concern', *Critical inquiry*, 30 (2004), 225–248

Roepstorff, Andreas, and Chris Frith, 'Neuroanthropology or Simply Anthropology? Going Experimental as Method, as Object of Study, and as Research Aesthetic', *Anthropological Theory*, 12 (2012), 101–111

Daniel Lende and Greg Downey, 2012. "Neuroanthropology and the encultured brain." In *The Encultured Brain: An Introduction to Neuroanthropology*. MIT Press.

Slaby, Jan, and Suparna Choudhury, 'Proposal for a Critical Neuroscience', in *Critical Neuroscience*, ed. by Suparna Choudhury and Jan Slaby (Wiley-Blackwell, 2011), pp. 27–51

Elizabeth A Wilson, 'Neurological Entanglements: The Case of Paediatric Depressions, SSRIs and Suicidal Ideation', *Subjectivity*, 4 (2011), 277–297.

Blackman, Lisa, 'Embodying Affect: Voice-hearing, Telepathy, Suggestion and Modelling the Non-conscious', *Body & Society*, 16 (2010), 163–192